MINUTES – Final
Commonwealth of Virginia
Identity Management Standards
Advisory Council (IMSAC)
Monday, December 7, 2015
Commonwealth Enterprise Solutions Center
11751 Meadowville Lane
Chester, VA 23836
Multipurpose Room 1222

ATTENDANCE
Members Present:
Dave Burhop
Katie Crepps
Jeremy Grant
Lisa Kimball
Nelson Moe
Tom Moran
Jeffrey Zubricki
Michael Watson

Others Present:
Addison, Karin (VADOC)
Colvin, Ashley (VITA)
Cushing, Patrick (Williams Mullen)
DuPree, Robert (Telos Corporation)
Finnegan, Tim (Centrify)
Fung, Anthony (Dep. SoTech)
Grossman, Richard (Vectre Corporation)
Grubbs, Joseph (VITA)
Helmantoler, Nicole (VITA)
Kimberly, John (Chenega Government Consulting)
Kissam, Todd (VITA)
Marian, Farnoosh (VITA)
Mercer, Kelly Thomasson (Dep. Secretary of COV)
Richards, Greg (OAG)
Rodis-Bradshaw, Sheila (DMV)
Tayloe, Denise (PRIVO)
Wallace, Patrick (McGuireWoods)

Members Absent:
None

CALL TO ORDER

In absence of the Secretary of Technology Karen Jackson, Chief Information Officer of the Commonwealth of Virginia Nelson Moe called the meeting to order at 1:04 p.m. in the VITA Multipurpose Room 1222 at the Commonwealth Enterprise Solutions Center in Chester, VA.

Note: The IMSAC meeting agenda packet including all of the presentation materials may be accessed on the VITA Web site at:

http://vita.virginia.gov/About/default.aspx?id=6442474173
NEW BUSINESS

Welcome and Announcement of Council Members

Members of IMSAC provided introductions.
- Nelson P. Moe - Chief Information Officer of the Commonwealth, Virginia Information Technologies Agency
- Dave Burhop - Deputy Commissioner/CIO, Department of Motor Vehicles
- Katie Crepps - Vice President, Card Tech, Capital One
- Jeremy Grant - Managing Director, The Chertoff Group
- Lisa E. Kimball - Vice President, Identity Management Solutions, Telos Corporation
- Tom Moran - Executive Director, All Hazards Consortium
- Jeffrey Zubricki - Director, Global Public Policy and Government Affairs, Walmart
- Michael Watson - Chief Information Security Officer of the Commonwealth of Virginia, Virginia Information Technologies Agency
- Nicole Helmantoler, IMSAC Staff Administrator, Virginia Information Technologies Agency

Administration of the Oath of Office

Ms. Kelly Thomasson Mercer, Deputy Secretary of the Commonwealth, administered the oath of office at 1:11 p.m.

Designation of Chairman

Pursuant to § 2.2-437.B, Mr. Moe requested open nominations for the position of chairman. Michael Watson nominated Jeremy Grant for the position of chairman. Mr. Grant respectfully declined the nomination. Mr. Watson nominated Lisa Kimball for the position of chairperson. Ms. Kimball graciously accepted the nomination.

Mr. Moe requested a motion to nominate Ms. Kimball as chairperson of IMSAC. Mr. Watson motioned, and Tom Moran seconded. Ms. Kimball was unanimously approved as chairperson of IMSAC.

Purpose and Scope of the Advisory Council

Mr. Gregory Richards, Assistant Attorney General, Office of the Attorney General, presented the purpose and scope of the Advisory Council. Pursuant to § 2.2-437.A, the Advisory Council advises the Secretary of Technology on the adoption of identity management standards and the creation of guidance documents pursuant to § 2.2-436. The Advisory Council recommends to the Secretary of Technology guidance documents relating to (i) nationally recognized technical and data standards regarding the verification and authentication of identity in digital and online transactions; (ii) the minimum specifications and standards that should be included in an identity trust framework, as defined in § 59.1-550, so as to warrant liability protection pursuant to the Electronic Identity Management Act (§ 59.1-550 et seq.); and (iii) any other related data
standards or specifications concerning reliance by third parties on identity credentials, as defined in § 59.1-550.

**Advisory Council Membership Responsibilities and FOIA Overview**

Mr. Richards discussed Advisory Council membership responsibilities and provided an overview of the Freedom of Information Act (FOIA). Mr. Richards presented to IMSAC a short video explaining FOIA, noting that pursuant to § 2.2 – 3702, members of the Advisory Council must read and become familiar with FOIA. Mr. Richards discussed the procedure for public meetings and for closed sessions. Mr. Richards noted that members of the Advisory Council are required to read and become familiar with the Public Records Act pursuant to § 42.1 – 76.1.

Mr. Richards presented the Policy on Individual Participation in Meetings of the Identity Management Standards Advisory Council by Electronic Means pursuant to § 2.2 – 3708.1. Ms. Helmantoler suggested to Chairperson Kimball that the policy be considered for adoption in the event that it is required. In response to Mr. Grant’s question about meeting locations, Mr. Richards clarified that meetings may be held anywhere that is accessible to the public and complies with all governing provisions for public bodies pursuant to the Code of Virginia. Additionally, should IMSAC choose to utilize working groups, Mr. Grant recommended that they consist of at least four members.

Chairperson Kimball asked for a motion to approve the policy pursuant to § 2.2 – 3708.1. Mr. Watson motioned to approve, Mr. Grant seconded the motion. Chairperson Kimball called for any opposition or abstention. Seeing none, the policy was unanimously approved by IMSAC.

**Review and Recommendation of Advisory Council Charter**

Ms. Nicole Helmantoler, IMSAC Staff Administrator, Virginia Information Technologies Agency (VITA), reviewed the proposed Advisory Council Charter. In addition to Advisory Council Responsibilities (§ 2.2-437.A; § 2.2-436.A) and Membership Governance Structures (§ 2.2-437.B), items added to the Charter include (1) meeting frequency and location, and (2) Interested Persons and Organizations.

(1) The Advisory Council will meet on a quarterly basis, the first Monday of March, June, September and December, for a minimum of two hours, 1:00-3:00 p.m. Meetings of the Advisory Council will be held as a public meeting, open to the public, and comply with all governing provisions for public bodies pursuant to the Code of Virginia. Meeting locations will be in facilities open and accessible to the public.

(2) The Advisory Council will develop methods for the identification and notification of interested parties and specific means of seeking input from interested persons and groups pursuant to § 2.2-437.C. The Advisory Council will identify and register with the Staff Administrator interested persons and groups for task areas identified on the Advisory Council’s Work Plan. The Advisory Council will hear testimony and comments from registered interested persons and groups in designated times and agenda items during its quarterly meetings. The Advisory Council will send a copy of such notices, comments, and other background material to the Joint Commission on Administrative Rules pursuant to § 2.2-437.C.
Ms. Helmantoler requested that the Charter be open to member input. The Advisory Council discussed the scope of IMSAC, noting that the third romanette is specific to credentialing.

Chairperson Kimball requested for a motion to adopt the charter as is. Mr. Grant motioned, and Mr. Moran seconded. The charter was unanimously approved as drafted.

**Commonwealth Travel Reimbursement Policies and Procedures**

Ms. Helmantoler reviewed Commonwealth of Virginia (COV) travel reimbursement policies and procedures. Advisory Council Members will serve without compensation but may be reimbursed for travel expenses incurred in the performance of their duties as provided in § 2.2-2825.

Advisory Council Members will be required to submit to the Staff Administrator originals of their signed Commonwealth Travel Reimbursement Forms and receipts. Travel reimbursement will be limited to those costs and amounts allowed pursuant to the Commonwealth Accounting Policies and Procedures (CAPP) Manual, published by the Department of Accounts: http://www.doa.virginia.gov/Admin_Services/CAPP/CAPP_Topics/20335-2015.pdf.

**Advisory Council Work Plan**

Chairperson Kimball asked for Mr. Michael Watson, Chief Information Security Officer of the Commonwealth, to present the Council Work Plan. Mr. Watson explained that National Strategy for Trusted Identities in Cyberspace (NSTIC) would provide a starting point for potential work plan task areas to build off; these include: communities of interest, trust frameworks, specifications for identity participants, interoperability and specifications for secure transactions, assurance programs and certification processes, trust marks, operational and administrative guidance. Ms. Watson asked for comments and additional commentary related to the Council Work Plan.

Mr. Grant expanded on the discussion by presenting a broader set of policy issues to consider. He identified a three party model of federated identity credentialing between parties: the Identity Provider (IDP), the Relying Party (RP), and the Individual User. Today, risk between these three actors is hard to define. Mr. Grant explained that this unbounded, unallocated risk discourages trust and inhibits the uptake of strong, federated identity solutions; the goal is to improve the risk equation. Notionally, there is high risk between all three parties. Without any certainty as to how risk is mitigated or allocated, the market will stall. Mr. Grant explained that the thesis of the COV’s new law is that if the IDP embraces high standards and best practices, risk is driven out of the equation, incenting adoption and use of strong, federated identity solutions. To incent IDPs to raise the bar, the law grants liability protections to firms that are certified in accordance with COV standards. Ms. Crepps added that there is a second piece to this – that they are not only solving for initial authentication, but also solving for the schemas behind it.

Members of the Advisory Council discussed recent publicized hacks and the risk incurred by individuals. Ms. Crepps suggested that there are two pieces to consider: 1) implementing best practices at procurement, and 2) creating uselessness in data in the way that it is stored. By doing the aforementioned, the weakest links are removed. Chairperson Kimball added that getting ahead of threat factors involves incentivization and education. She stressed that these measures must be actionable and enforceable, and must have authority behind them.
Mr. Grant discussed the identity ecosystem framework, though he explained that a formal certification scheme has not been determined – largely because there is no single driver in the workplace to incentivize certification. Mr. Burhop discussed credentialing and risk from the Department of Motor Vehicles' (DMV) perspective. Mr. Zubricki discussed reasserting credentials in the event that information is compromised, especially in how consumers and the state interact in the medical space.

Mr. Moran explained that in order to get unity of understanding around the issue at hand, there is a need for greater specificity. He asked if members would find it helpful to put forth use cases in order to develop this unity in understanding among stakeholders. Ms. Crepps agreed that use cases would be a good place to start, especially to determine where the highest risk level lies. Mr. Grant also agreed that use cases would be appropriate, recognizing that there would be a few risk profiles for each use case. Mr. Burhop agreed that use cases would be helpful, especially in dealing with e-identity, for example. He discussed a current DMV endeavor to create a mobile driver’s license to be hosted on smart devices.

Chairperson Kimball concurred that use cases would be an appropriate first step. She stressed that education is absolutely crucial such that technical information can be effectively communicated to the layperson. Chairperson Kimball would like members to recommend Subject Matter Experts to present to the Advisory Council. Members of the Advisory Council discussed how best to go about recruiting subject matter experts and developing use cases.

Mr. Watson asked the members for their initial preferences of topic to work towards. Ms. Crepps identified authentication as a crucial starting point. Mr. Burhop suggested reaching out to the Health Information Technology Standards Advisory Committee (HITSAC) for a use case related to moving e-credentialing forward in the health care space. Other topics mentioned by members included federation, privacy and application of biometrics and geo-location. Chairperson Kimball encouraged members to consider what is next technologically, giving the example of protection of behavior-metrics (e.g., way you type your password).

Chairperson Kimball then posed the following question: how do you define framework? Mr. Watson agreed that defining a framework is the best place to begin, allowing members to determine the aspects to be covered as part of recommendations to the Secretary of Technology.

Mr. Burhop discussed standard certification guidelines. He suggested that members look at current, operational trust frameworks to get an idea of what can work. Chairperson Kimball asked for any additional suggestions and approaches for the Advisory Council.

Mr. Moe posed questions regarding support for the Advisory Council. Additionally, he asked about current timeframes for deliverables. Mr. Burhop suggested that the Advisory Council should focus on reviewing frameworks, either operational or out for public comment, and then developing use cases. He explained that a typical timeframe for deliverables would be around eight to fourteen months. Mr. Watson noted that IMSAC should prepare initial recommendations by September 2016 to meet legislation deadlines. As an aside, Mr. Watson clarified that state internal operation requirements are separate, and will operate independently, from what will be presented here. Mr. Grant suggested that Tom Smedinghoff, an attorney specializing in legal issues regarding electronic transactions, identity management, privacy, information security, and online authentication issues from both a transactional and public policy perspective, be
considered as a subject matter expert in a forthcoming meeting. The next IMSAC meeting is slated for March, so Chairperson Kimball will coordinate with Ms. Helmantoler in preparing the agenda for that meeting.

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Chairperson Kimball called for public comment.

Ms. Denise Tayloe, PRIVO, expressed concern at IMSAC’s focus on identity credentials, citing trust frameworks as an important topic to undertake. Chairperson Kimball clarified that trust frameworks are indeed an important consideration, and that the focus on identity credentials is specific to the third bullet under Advisory Council responsibilities.

Ms. Helmantoler informed the public that meeting minutes will be posted within two weeks. IMSAC agendas will be posted such that there is ample time for interested parties to participate in meetings.

Mr. Grant informed IMSAC and the public that the National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST) is hosting a public workshop in January on the topic of Applying Measurement Science in the Identity Ecosystem.

Mr. Burhop proposed that IMSAC host longer meetings. Chairperson Kimball asked members if they would be amenable to longer meetings, to which all agreed.

Chairperson Kimball called for additional public comment. Seeing none, Chairperson Kimball closed the public comment item.

**ADJOURNMENT**

Chairperson Kimball opened the meeting for any final comments from IMSAC. Seeing none, Chairperson Kimball adjourned the meeting with consent from IMSAC members.